

Can the Integral Complementarity of Woman and Man be Proved? Overview and Charts
March 21, 2017 Edith Stein Lecture, Franciscan University of Steubenville
Handout

Sr. Prudence Allen, RSM, PhD

Glory to the Father and to the Son and to the Holy Spirit
Mary, Seat of Wisdom, Pray for us.

Outline of Lecture

Introduction:

Method of Research- from the perspective of philosophy

Identify four elements of the Concept of Woman [opposites, generation, wisdom, virtue]
 Identify first theory across all four elements Plato's unisex theory –equal dignity
 Identify second theory across all four elements Aristotle's sex polarity theory –significant difference with male naturally superior over female

Method of Theology

Trace these two theories until complementarity entered the discussion- both equal dignity and significant difference:

Book of Genesis [Four factors: equal dignity, significant difference, synergetic relation, and intergenerational fruition]

Incarnation of Jesus Christ and Medieval Philosophy

Newman and the Question Can Integral Complementarity be Proved?

Seven Criteria in *An Essay on the Development of Christian Doctrine*:

1. Preserve Identity of Original Type through all its apparent changes and vicissitudes from first to last.
2. Continuity of Principles in the type remained entire from first to last, in spite of process of development. Changes do not destroy the type.
3. Assimilative Power (of Dogmatic Truth).
4. Logical Sequence (in fidelity in development).
5. Anticipation of its future (in favor of the fidelity of development, ethical or political).
6. Conservative action on its past (of its original) with corruption tending to its destruction
7. Chronic vigor of a true development of an idea in distinction from its corruptions, perversions, and decays.

Trace the development of Integral Gender Complementarity

Volume One: *Concept of Woman: The Aristotelian Revolution (750BC-1250AD)*

Two Original Ideas Need to be identified and traced.

1. Integral unity of a woman or a man
2. Complementary relation of a woman and a man

Original Type of Living Idea of the Human Being: Male or Female

Aristotle (384-322 BC)

Original Type of Living Idea of Complementarity: Man and Woman

St. Augustine (354-430)

Preservation of Type, Continuity of Principles, and Assimilative Power of these two Living Ideas

St. Hildegard of Bingen (1098-1179) developed complementarity consistency
 St. Thomas Aquinas (1224-1274) developedhylomorphism with soul as form and spirit
 Corruption: John Scotus Erigena (810-877) and unisex theory

Inevitable Conflict: Complementarity Threatened and Defended

Volume Two: *Concept of Woman (1250-1500): The Early Humanist Reformation*

Four Communities of discourse traced: Academic, Satirical, Religious, Humanist

Traditional Polarity satires devalued women: Complementarity defended by humanist
 Christine de Pizan (1344-1430)

Reverse Polarity devalued men: Henrich Agrippa (1486-1536) and Lucrezia Marinella (1571-1653) offered humanist arguments defending woman's superiority over men

Inevitable Conflict:

Volume Three: *The Concept of Woman: Search for Communion of Persons (1500-2015)*

Cartesian Unisex Dualism shatters Unity of Human Being but strengthens equality of man and woman

Rene Descartes (1596-1650), Princess Elizabeth of Bohemia (1618-1680), Poullain de la Barre (1647-1723), Mary Astell (1679-1749), Marie Gouze (1748-1793), and Marquis de Condorcet (1745-1794)

Complementarity Corrupted into Fractional Complementarity in Reform Theories of Differentiation of Man and Woman

Jean Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778), Mary Wollstonecraft's (1757-1797), Immanuel Kant (1724-1804), Arthur Schopenhauer (1788-1860), Frederick Hegel (1770-1831); Soren Kierkegaard (1813-1855); Frederick Nietzsche (1844-1900)

In Reformed marriages, the man and woman become one person

Integral Catholic Lived Complementarity in Implicit dynamism in Counter-Reformation

Chronic Vigor of Living Idea of Human Being and Complementarity in Phenomenology and NeoThomism

Jacques (1882-1973) and Raissa (1883-1960) Maritain; Dietrich von Hildebrand (1889-1977); Edith Stein (1891-1942); Gertrud von Le Fort (1876-1971), Bernard Lonergan, SJ (1904-1984), Emmanuel Mounier (1905-1950); Gabriel Marcel (1889-1973); Roman Ingarden (1893-1970)

Corruption of Human Person and Relation in Sex and Gender Ideologies

Albert Kinsey (1894-1956), Margaret Mead (1901-1978), John Money (1921-2006), Michel Foucault (1926-1984), Alice Rossi (1922-2009), Kate Millett (b. 1934), Gayle Rubin (b. 1949), Spread of Gender Ideology, Postmodernists, UN Conferences

Corruption of Human Person and Relation in Philosopher's turned atheists

Jean Paul Sartre (1905-1980), Simone de Beauvoir (1908-1985), Mary Daly (1928-2010)

Mapping and Attaching Gender Ideology Virus

Mary Ann Glendon (n. 1938), Dale O'Leary (1941-), Marguerite Peeters, and Vatican Conferences

Chronic Vigor in Development of Integral Complementarity

Hans Urs von Balthasar (1905-1988), W. Norris Clarke, SJ (1915-2008). Alice von Hildebrand (1923-), Gertrude Elizabeth M. Anscombe (1919-2001), M.A. Krapiec (1921-2008)

Fidelity of Development and Anticipation of Future for Gender Reality in Personalism and Integral Gender Complementarity

Karol Wojtyla (1920-1978) Philosopher of Integral Complementarity

The Human Person as man/male/masculine and woman/female/feminine

Saint John Paul II (1978-2005) Apostle of Integral Complementarity

Integral Complementarity of Three Paradigm Vocations in the Church

Integral Complementarity of Woman and Man Proved by Newman's Seven Criteria for True Development and Lived by many women and men in the world

Historical Development of Dimensions of Integral Gender Complementarity

Component of Identity	Date begun	Geometrical analogy	Foundation of Characteristic
female-male	6 th century BC	Point	One dimensional reduction to biological base
feminine- masculine	15 th century AD	Triangle	Two dimensional cultural characteristics in reified psyche
woman-man	19 th century	Tetrahedron	Three dimensional self-defining individual
"Complementarity" named	First half of 20 th century	Structure named	Physics extended to metaphysics and ontology
communion of persons	Second half of 20 th century	Conic spirals united	Four dimensional self-giving woman persons and man persons in synergetic relations

HISTORY OF SELECTED THEORIES OF GENDER IDENTITY

Historical Period	Unisex Theories	Polarity Theories	Complementarity Theories
Ancient and Medieval Roots	Plato 428-355 BC Porphyry 235-305 John Scotus Erigena 810-877 Avicenna 980-1037	Traditional Aristotle 384-322 BC Philo 13 BC-AD 54 Plotinus 205-270 Averroes 1126-1198 Albert the Great 1193-1280 Giles of Rome 1243-1316 Imaging Reverse Polarity Boethius 480-524 Dante 1265-1321	Fractional Augustine 354-430 Anselm 1033- 1109 Hildegard of Bingen 1098-1179 Moving to Integral Thomas Aquinas 1224-1274
Renaissance and Modern Developments	Neoplatonic Unisex Giovanni Pico della Mirandola 1463-1494 Cartesian Unisex Descartes 1590-1650 Maria van Schurman 1607-1678 Poullain de la Barre 1647-1723 Mary Astell 1666-1731 Marquis de Condorcet 1743-1794 Olympe de Gouges 1748-1793 Mary Wollstonecraft 1759-1797	Traditional Aristotelian Satires: <i>Le Roman de la rose</i> 13 th c. Leon Battista Alberti 1404-1472 Polarity Embedded in Fractional Complementarity Jean Jacques Rousseau 1712-1778 Immanuel Kant 1724-1804 Reverse Polarity Henreich Cornelius Agrippa 1486-1536 Lucrezia Marinelli 1571-1653	Fractional Giovanni Bocaccio 1313-1375 Christine de Pizan 1344-1430 Leonardo Bruni 1369-1444 Francesco Barbaro 1390-1454 Nicholas of Cusa 1401-1464 Integral Isotta Nogarola 1418-1466 Albrecht von Eyb 1420-1475 Laura Cereta 1469-1499 Catholic men and women working together in complementarity relations in Europe and the New World and Promotion of the Sacred Heart of Jesus

<p>19th-21st Century Challenges and Principles</p>	<p>Marxist feminism Karl Marx 1818-1883 Frederick Engels 1820-1895 Emma Goldman 1869-1940 Selma James Marlene Dixon Shulamith Firestone</p> <p>Sex and Gender Ideologies Albert Kinsey 1894-1956 Margaret Mead 1901-1978 John Money 1921-2006 Michel Foucault 1926-1984 Alice Rossi 1922-2009 Kate Millett 1934- Gayle Rubin 1949-</p> <p>Secular feminism Betty Friedan 1921-2006 National Organization of Women (NOW) Bella Abzug 1920-1998</p> <p>Equality moving to identity of men and women in all areas of work and public life including same sex marriage</p>	<p>Traditional: Superiority of Male in Fractional Complementarity</p> <p>Frederick Hegel 1770-1831 Arthur Schopenhauer 1788-1860 Soren Kierkegaard 1813-1855 Frederick Nietzsche 1844-1900 Carl Jung 1875-1961</p> <p>Traditional : Superiority of Male Mind and Body Sigmund Freud 1856-1939 Jean Paul Sartre 1905-1980 Lionel Tiger 1937-</p> <p>Simone DeBeauvoir 1908-1985 traditional polarity moving to reverse polarity</p> <p>Reverse: Superiority of Female Body and Mind Radical Feminism Valerie Solanis p. 1967 Mary Daly 1928 -2010 French feminists</p> <p>Rejection of men and gender as ontological categories</p>	<p>Fractional: Theodor Gottlieb von Hippel 1741-1796 John Stuart Mill 1806-1873 Harriet Taylor 1807-1858</p> <p>Integral Deitrich von Hildebrand 1889-1977 Gabriel Marcel 1889-1973 Edith Stein 1891-1942 Jacques Maritain 1893-1960 Raissa Maritain 1893-1960 Emmanuel Mounier 1905-1950 Bernard Lonergan 1904-1984 Hans Urs von Balthasar 1905-1988 W. Norris Clarke 1915-2008 Gertrude Elizabeth Anscombe 1919-2001 Karol Wojtyla 1920-/ John Paul II 1978-2005 M.A. Krapiec 1921-2008 Alice von Hildebrand 1923- Mary Ann Glendon 1938- M. Prudence Allen, RSM 1940- Jean Bethke Elsthai 1941-2003</p> <p>New foundation for integral complementarity drawing upon Thomistic metaphysics and phenomenology</p>
---	---	---	--

Special interactions in Communion of Persons to link Edith Stein and Karol Wojtyla

Edith Stein and Dietrich von Hildebrand were graduate students together.

Edith Stein attended one of Jacques and Raissa Maritain's Thomistic meetings at Meudon.

Edith Stein and Roman Ingarden were close friends in graduate studies and both met together and corresponded frequently. He communicated his knowledge of her work to Karol Wojtyla 1951-53.

KAROL WOJTYLA/JOHN PAUL II

Integral Gender Complementarity

Philosophical Aspects

Ontological Complementarity

Integration of 4 levels

Biological

Individual

Personal

Spiritual

Man-Woman Complementarity

WOMAN

MAN

<p>1. Female corporeal structure oriented towards supporting growth of new life within as mother</p> <p>A. By ovulation from puberty to menopause</p> <p>B. Reinforced by pregnancy and birth.</p> <p>2. Psycho-emotive consciousness of this bodily experience is the origin of the maternal instinct which makes women capable of being open to another human being</p>	<p><u>Biological Complementarity</u></p> <p><u>Female/Male Structure</u></p> <p>Hylomorphism</p> <p>consciousness external and internal sensitive powers (emotions)</p>	<p>1. Male corporeal structure oriented towards reproducing by detachment of seed as father.</p> <p>2. A man remains outside the process of pregnancy and birth and so has to learn his fatherhood from the mother.</p>
<p>1. With the intellect and will, a woman decides how she will act as a woman.</p> <p>2. A woman can choose to access her maternal instinct or to reject it (as in the case of abortion).</p> <p>3. Feminine is a woman's way of being in the world.</p> <p>4. A woman's femininity is fulfilled by different forms of maternity.</p>	<p><u>Individual Complementarity</u></p> <p><u>Woman/Man Structure</u></p> <p>Faculties:</p> <p>intellect will</p>	<p>1. With the intellect and will, a man decides how he will act as a man</p> <p>2. A man can choose to learn from women how to be open to another person or to remain closed.</p> <p>3. Masculine is a man's way of being in the world.</p> <p>4. A man's masculinity is fulfilled by different forms of paternity.</p>

<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A woman's part is to receive new life and to pay attention to the person in all circumstances. 2. Women need to overcome all utilitarian tendencies to use men for sentiment. 3. A woman's genius is to bring the dynamism of attention to the dignity of the person into all situations in society. 4. Women should use their feminine genius to overcome all discrimination, violence, or exploitation in union with old feminism. 5. Women should discover their feminine genius to support the human person in all areas in which they have a sphere of influence to contribute their part to new feminism. 	<p align="center"><u>Personal Complementarity</u></p> <p align="center"><u>Man-Woman</u></p> <p align="center"><u>Relational Structure</u></p> <p align="center">The law of the gift</p> <p align="center">Applied to Old and to New Feminism</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A man's part is to protect new life and provide for its development. 2.. Men need to overcome all utilitarian tendencies to use women for sensuality. 3. Man's dominion (not domination) in the world is built up by their genius in culture, education, and technology, and efficiency. 4. Men should use their masculine genius to overcome all discrimination, violence, or exploitation in union with old feminism. 5. Men should coordinate their masculine genius with women's feminine genius to support a culture of life as their contribution to building a new feminism.
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Blessed Virgin Mary became a mother by conceiving Jesus in her body after accepting him with her personal intellect and will. 2. God entrusts the human being to women in every circumstance. 3. The father of lies waits to destroy the human being and can fool a woman into killing the human being entrusted to her. 4. Women's part is to confront the culture of death by choosing to affirm life in every circumstance. 	<p align="center"><u>Spiritual Complementarity</u></p> <p align="center"><u>Relation to God</u></p> <p align="center">Communion of persons in likeness to Divine Communion of Persons</p> <p align="center">Culture of Life vs. Culture of Death</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. St. Joseph became a father by accepting/adopting Jesus with his personal intellect and will. 2. Man called by God to protect and provide for new life in every circumstance. 3. The father of lies can fool a man into destroying life by abandoning a woman or forcing her to kill it. 4. Man's part is to confront the culture of death by choosing to affirm life in every circumstance.

Further References:

See Sr. Prudence Allen, RSM, *The Concept of Woman: The Aristotelian Revolution 750BC-1250AD* (Grand Rapids/Cambridge: Eerdmans, 1997);-----; *The Concept of Woman: The Early Humanist Reformation (1250-1500)* (Grand Rapids/Cambridge: Eerdmans 2002); *The Concept of Woman: Search for Communion of Persons (1500-2015)* (Grand Rapids/Cambridge : Eerdmans, 2016).

-----; "Four Principles of Complementarity: A Philosophical Perspective", in Steven Loapes and Helen Alvere. Eds., *Not Just Good, but Beautiful* (Walden, New York: Plough Publishing Co., 2015), 49-60.

-----; "Man-Woman Complementarity: The Catholic Inspiration," in *Logos: A Journal of Catholic Thought and Culture* 9:3 (summer 2006): 87-108.

-----; "Philosophy of Relation in John Paul II's New Feminism," and "Can Feminism be a Humanism," in Michelle Schumacher, ed, *Women in Christ: Towards a New Feminism* (Grand Rapids/Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2004), 67-105 and 251-284.